Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

From:

Richard M. Glover [RMG@LewisBabcock.com]

Sent:

Monday, February 02, 2009 3:22 PM

To: Subject: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) RE: Tuomey claims data

Attachments:

166343 - 166535.pdf

Tracy, just to be clear – the documents 166343 - 166535 were produced to you on disk number 166157. I am enclosing a pdf that we made of the spreadsheets for your records.

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Friday, January 30, 2009 4:37 PM

To: Jonathan Harling **Cc:** Richard M. Glover

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

Did Richard send them by regular mail? If so, they may not have reached us yet. Incredibly, I just got something today that Joe Griffith sent Jan. 12. For these productions, we would really appreciate receiving them by overnight or second-day courier. Not trying to increase costs, but they are still irradiating mail that comes to us through regular USPS delivery and it can take weeks to get here.

Thanks for checking, Jonathan.

Tracy

From: Jonathan Harling [mailto:WJH@LewisBabcock.com]

Sent: Friday, January 30, 2009 4:31 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) **Cc:** Richard M. Glover

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

They were sent on January 13, I will get Richard to resend.

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Friday, January 30, 2009 4:32 PM

To: Jonathan Harling

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

Hi Jonathan: We don't seem to have numbers 166343-166535. Could you please send those to us again?

Thanks.

Tracy

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 2 of 17

From: Jonathan Harling [mailto:WJH@LewisBabcock.com]

Sent: Friday, January 30, 2009 3:25 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

Tracey – see 166343-166535, 172036-172089, 153227-153522, and 153523-153870.

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Friday, January 30, 2009 1:42 PM

To: Jonathan Harling

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

Exactly. Thanks again.

From: Jonathan Harling [mailto:WJH@LewisBabcock.com]

Sent: Friday, January 30, 2009 1:38 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

I will check. Are you referencing medicare/Medicaid claims?

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Friday, January 30, 2009 1:36 PM

To: Jonathan Harling

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: Tuomey claims data

Hi Jonathan: I'm trying to determine if Tuomey has yet provided its claims data, similar to the CMS data that we provided to you some months ago. If Tuomey has done so, would you please identify the bates range for the data? Thanks very much.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel.: (202)307-0474 Fax: (202)305-4117 3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 3 of 17

Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

From: Dan Mulholland [DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Tuesday, July 07, 2009 5:14 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV); Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Cc: Jonathan Harling; Mary G. Lewis

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data dictionary and field layouts

Tracy: the letter we sent was intended to address Norman's letter revised RFAs only. I plan to send you a separate letter dealing with the other items we discussed. I was waiting to hear from you about the status of Ruben Steck's errata sheet, since one of the points in your letter dealt asked for more specificity as to what portions of his report we disputed. Now that you have informed me that it is coming, I can get you a letter addressing the other items by Friday. As for the call with Mr. Steck and the hospital people, 1030 can work, although 1130 would work better since Jim Bowman, the person who put together the spreadsheets with the claims data could also be on the line. 1030 to 1130 was the only time he could not do the call on Friday, but one of the I.T. people, Micky Lloyd could be on the call at 1030 if that is the only time you can make it. I would be glad to set up a call in number. as for the extension of time to file a motion to compel, I have no problem with granting such an extension, but when you see our response to the remaining issues I don't think a motion will be necessary.

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, July 07, 2009 4:39 PM

To: Dan Mulholland; Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Cc: Jonathan Harling; Mary G. Lewis

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data dictionary and field layouts

Hi Dan: We have reviewed Defendant's responses to the United States' revised Request for Admission Nos. 1-8. We appreciate your efforts to engage in a meaningful meet and confer and to attempt to address the concerns we raised about the initial responses. While we think some of the responses to the revised requests contain extraneous material, we do not plan to challenge the substance of those responses under Rule 36 or 37.

During the meet and confer, you agreed also to reconsider Defendant's responses to Request for Admission Nos. 9-13 (the items addressed in numbered paragraphs 3 and 4 of my June 16, 2009 letter). We do not believe we have seen any revision to those responses. Can you please inform us whether you intend to revise the responses to these items or not?

Also, Ruben Steck and we are available for a call on Friday morning, as you suggested yesterday, to discuss the production of the hospital's relevant Medicare and Medicaid claims data. Two questions: (1) Will 10:30 am work for you and the Tuomey folks? (2) Our deadline for filing a motion to compel is on Friday (by our prior agreement), and we obviously will not have the claims data in hand by that date because we are going to

EXHIBIT 9B

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 4 of 17

be talking about it that same day. Will Tuomey agree to an enlargement of time for the potential filing of a motion to compel sufficient to allow the production and review of the hospital's claims data? (We can discuss what that time period should be during our Friday call.)

Please call me if you have any questions.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel: (202) 307-0474 Fax: (202) 305-4117

From: Dan Mulholland [mailto:DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Tuesday, July 07, 2009 8:08 AM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV); Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Cc: Jonathan Harling; Mary G. Lewis

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data dictionary and field layouts

thanks.

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Monday, July 06, 2009 4:59 PM

To: Dan Mulholland; Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Cc: Jonathan Harling; Mary G. Lewis

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data dictionary and field layouts

Hi Dan: The errata sheet is done and should be on its way. I will check on the Friday morning time with everyone here and get back to you.

Thanks.

Tracy

From: Dan Mulholland [mailto:DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Monday, July 06, 2009 4:47 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV); Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Cc: Jonathan Harling; Mary G. Lewis

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data dictionary and field layouts

Tracy: Wednesday is no good for me. how is Friday morning? also, did Mr. Steck complete his errata sheet?

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Monday, July 06, 2009 4:40 PM

To: Dan Mulholland; Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Cc: Jonathan Harling; Mary G. Lewis

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data dictionary and field layouts

Hi Dan: Ruben Steck feels that it will be most productive for us to take you up on your prior offer to have him speak directly (with counsel on the call) with the Tuomey claims data folks in order to identify the most appropriate data format and fields for Tuomey's Medicare and Medicaid claims during the relevant time period. We are all available on Wednesday after 2. Would you and the appropriate Tuomey indiviudal(s) be available then as well for a conference call to nail down the claims data issue? If not, what other times this week would work?

Thanks.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel: (202) 307-0474 Fax: (202) 305-4117

From: Dan Mulholland [mailto:DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Thursday, July 02, 2009 2:50 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV); Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Cc: Jonathan Harling; Mary G. Lewis

Subject: Tuomey claims data dictionary and field layouts

Tracy: I have attached information and included some below which I have received from Tuomey that we believe is what you requested in terms of the data dictionary and field layouts for the claims data we previously sent. Please let me know if this is what you want. We are compiling the actual claims data in xls format and hope to be able to produce it to you next week.

DSMC-04 (Day surgery medicare)

DSMCD-04 (day surgery Medicaid)

IMARC-04 (inpatient medicare arc unit)

IMC-04 (inpatient medicare)

IMCD-04 (inpatient Medicaid)

IMCDED0004 (inpatient medicare – old 2000 claims)

IMCPB-04 (This is medicare part b)

IMSSC-04 (inpatient sub acute medicare)

OBMC-04 (observation medicare)

OBMCD-04 (observation Medicaid)

OMC-04 (outpatient medicare)

OMCD-04 (outpatient Medicaid)

OMCDTHY-04 (outpatient Medicaid therapy)

OMCTHY-04 (outpatient medicare therapy)

HICIDER1 INPT HIC MEDICAID (ER)

HICIDPEPER INPT HIC MEDICAID PEP (ER)

HICIDPRO INPT HIC MEDICAID (PRO)

HICIMER INPT HIC MEDICARE (PRO-ER)

HICIMPRO INPT HIC MEDICARE (PRO)

HICIMPVL HIC MEDICARE (PVL)

HICOBSDER OBSER HIC MEDICAID (ER)

HICOBSDPEP OBSER HIC MEDICAID PEP (ER)

HICOBSDPRO OBSER HIC MEDICAID (PRO)

HICOBSMER OBSER HIC MEDICARE (ER)

HICOBSMPRO OBSER HIC MEDICARE (PRO)

HICOBSMPVL OBSER HIC MEDICARE (PVL)

HICOBSPEP OBSER HIC MEDICAID PEP (PRO)

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page	? 7 of	17

HICODER	OUTPT HIC MEDICAID		(ER)
HICODPEPER	OUTPT HIC MEDICAID PE	P (ER)	
HICODPRO	OUTPT HIC MEDICAID	(PRO)	
HICOM	OUTPT HIC MEDICARE	(PVL)	
HICOMER	OUTPT HIC MEDICARE	(ER)	
HICOMPRO	OUTPT HIC MEDICARE	(PRO)	
HICOPEPPRO OUTPT HIC MEDICAID PEP (PRO)			
HICSDCDER	OPSDC HIC MEDICAID	(ER)	
HICSDCDER1	OPSDC HIC MEDICAID P	EP	(ER)
HICSDCDPRO	OPSDC HIC MEDICAID	(Pl	RO)
HICSDCMER	OPSDC HIC MEDICARE	(ER)	
HICSDCMPRO	OPSDC HIC MEDICARE	(PRO)	
HICSDCMPVL	OPSDC HIC MEDICARE	(P	VL)
HICSDCPEP	OPSDC HIC MEDICAID P	EP	(PRO)

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677 3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 8 of 17

Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

From:

Dan Mulholland [DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent:

Friday, July 10, 2009 3:24 PM

To:

Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

Cc:

Acker, Norman (USANCE); kbarth@hbbh.net; SaMiller@wcsr.com; acl@lewisbabcock.com;

mgl@lewisbabcock.com; WJH@LewisBabcock.com; O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject:

RE: Confidential

Tracy: you are correct in your understanding. Please let me know if you have any questions about my letter.

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Friday, July 10, 2009 3:11 PM

To: Dan Mulholland

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); kbarth@hbbh.net; SaMiller@wcsr.com; acl@lewisbabcock.com; mgl@lewisbabcock.com;

WJH@LewisBabcock.com; O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: RE: Confidential

Thanks, Dan. Also, we understand that the parties agree that the discussions about the production of Tuomey's claims data, including our lengthy discussion today, concern appropriate supplementation, in accordance with Rule 26(e), of Tuomey's initial Rule 26(a) disclosures and its earlier responses to the government's written discovery requests. Please advise me if you do not agree with this understanding.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice

Civil Division (Frauds) Tel: (202) 307-0474 Fax: (202) 305-4117

From: Dan Mulholland [mailto:DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Friday, July 10, 2009 2:56 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); kbarth@hbbh.net; SaMiller@wcsr.com; acl@lewisbabcock.com; mgl@lewisbabcock.com;

WJH@LewisBabcock.com **Subject:** Confidential

July 10, 2009

Tracy L. Hilmer

EXHIBIT 9C

Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division (Frauds) 601 D Street, NW Washington, DC 20044

Attached please find a letter re: U.S. ex rel. Drakeford v. Tuomey -- Requests for Admission and Interrogatories. If you have any questions, or if I can be of further assistance, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern (412)687-7677 3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 10 of 17

Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

From:

Dan Mulholland [DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent:

Tuesday, September 01, 2009 2:25 PM Hilmer, Tracy (CIV); Jonathan Harling

To: Cc:

Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject:

RE: Tuomey data

will do

Dan Mulholland

Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, September 01, 2009 2:19 PM

To: Dan Mulholland; Jonathan Harling

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: FW: Tuomey data

Hi Dan: I'm forwarding a request from Ruben Steck for further information about the Tuomey claims data you produced to us last month. Would you please forward the request, in turn, to your contacts at Tuomey and let us know whether the requested information can be provided?

Thank you.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel

U.S. Department of Justice

Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel: (202) 307-0474 Fax: (202) 305-4117

From: Ruben Steck [mailto:rsteck@steckconsulting.com]

Sent: Tuesday, September 01, 2009 12:41 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) **Subject:** Tuomey data

Hi Tracy,

I was out on vacation for a little over two weeks (mostly without cell reception or email access) – sorry for the slow response.

The Tuomey-provided data (patient-level and transaction-level) appears to provide information for us to compare their claims data to the data we used in our analyses. To perform a complete comparison, however, we will need "look-up tables" for many of the fields. A look-up table provides a list of codes and their meanings (a good example is the CPT codes – each code indicates a specific procedure).

EXHIBIT 9 D

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 11 of 17

In the patient-level data we see the following fields for which we need to know the possible values and the associated meanings:

- InpatientServiceID
- OutpatientLocationID
- FinancialClassID
- Ins1
- Ins2

In the transaction-level data, we need look-up tables for the following fields:

- Type
- TransProcedureID

We also find five different provider IDs in the patient-level data for which we will need a look-up table to identify the physicians (by UPIN and/or name, at a minimum):

- AdmitProviderID
- AttendProviderID
- ErProviderID
- FamilyProviderID
- OtherProviderID

Please let me know if I can provide any additional information or details, or if you have any questions.

Thanks, Ruben

Ruben Steck / Steck Consulting, LLC / Tel: 202-887-0190 / Fax: 202-887-0193 1730 Rhode Island Ave, NW / Suite 200 / Washington, DC 20036

PRIVILEGED ATTORNEY/CLIENT COMMUNICATION AND/OR ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT. The information in this transmittal may be privileged and/or confidential. It is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are neither the intended recipient(s) nor a person responsible for the delivery of this transmittal to the intended recipient(s), you are hereby notified that any distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify Steck Consulting, LLC at 202.887.0191.

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 12 of 17

Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

From:

Dan Mulholland [DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: To: Monday, October 05, 2009 7:57 AM Hilmer, Tracy (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Cc:

Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject:

RE: Tuomey data

can do Tracy. I will follow up with the hospital. by the way, could you please send us a copy of the power point presentation you made in court the other day? thanks.

Dan Mulholland

Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Friday, October 02, 2009 3:09 PM **To:** Dan Mulholland; Jonathan Harling

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: RE: Tuomey data

Hi Dan: As you requested after Wednesday's hearing, I am re-forwarding the request for additional information regarding Tuomey's claims data. With trial now scheduled, we need to resolve the data issues ASAP.

Thanks.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel

U.S. Department of Justice

Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel: (202)307-0474 Fax: (202)305-4117

From: Dan Mulholland [mailto:DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Tuesday, September 01, 2009 2:25 PM **To:** Hilmer, Tracy (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: RE: Tuomey data

will do

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677 3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 13 of 17

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, September 01, 2009 2:19 PM

To: Dan Mulholland; Jonathan Harling

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV)

Subject: FW: Tuomey data

Hi Dan: I'm forwarding a request from Ruben Steck for further information about the Tuomey claims data you produced to us last month. Would you please forward the request, in turn, to your contacts at Tuomey and let us know whether the requested information can be provided?

Thank you.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel: (202) 307-0474 Fax: (202) 305-4117

From: Ruben Steck [mailto:rsteck@steckconsulting.com]

Sent: Tuesday, September 01, 2009 12:41 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) **Subject:** Tuomey data

Hi Tracy,

I was out on vacation for a little over two weeks (mostly without cell reception or email access) – sorry for the slow response.

The Tuomey-provided data (patient-level and transaction-level) appears to provide information for us to compare their claims data to the data we used in our analyses. To perform a complete comparison, however, we will need "look-up tables" for many of the fields. A look-up table provides a list of codes and their meanings (a good example is the CPT codes – each code indicates a specific procedure).

In the patient-level data we see the following fields for which we need to know the possible values and the associated meanings:

- InpatientServiceID
- OutpatientLocationID
- FinancialClassID
- Ins1
- Ins2

In the transaction-level data, we need look-up tables for the following fields:

- Type
- TransProcedureID

We also find five different provider IDs in the patient-level data for which we will need a look-up table to identify the physicians (by UPIN and/or name, at a minimum):

- AdmitProviderID
- AttendProviderID
- ErProviderID

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 14 of 17

- FamilyProviderID
- OtherProviderID

Please let me know if I can provide any additional information or details, or if you have any questions.

Thanks, Ruben

Ruben Steck / Steck Consulting, LLC / Tel: 202-887-0190 / Fax: 202-887-0193 1730 Rhode Island Ave, NW / Suite 200 / Washington, DC 20036

PRIVILEGED ATTORNEY/CLIENT COMMUNICATION AND/OR ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT. The information in this transmittal may be privileged and/or confidential. It is intended only for the recipient(s) listed above. If you are neither the intended recipient(s) nor a person responsible for the delivery of this transmittal to the intended recipient(s), you are hereby notified that any distribution or copying of this transmittal is prohibited. If you have received this transmittal in error, please notify Steck Consulting, LLC at 202.887.0191.

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 15 of 17

Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

From:

Dan Mulholland [DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent:

Tuesday, November 03, 2009 12:07 PM

To:

Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

Cc:

Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Subject: Attachments:

RE: Tuomey claims data Dan Mulholland.vcf

Tracy: a disk containing this information was to have been sent to you from Lewis and Babcock by paralegal Richard

Gloverlast week. by copy of this email I will ask Jonathan to chack on status of it.

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412.687.7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, November 03, 2009 12:04 PM

To: Dan Mulholland

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

Hi Dan: Can you please give me an update on when you expect to provide us with the hospital's claims data? At this point, with only 2 weeks until the exhibits will be exchanged, it may not be possible for Ruben Steck to analyze the hospital's data before the deadline. He will analyze it as soon as practicable after he receives it, and there may need to be additional or updated charts for him to prepare.

Thanks.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel

U.S. Department of Justice

Civil Division (Frauds) Tel: (202)307-0474

Fax: (202)305-4117

From: Dan Mulholland [mailto:DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Wednesday, October 21, 2009 4:40 PM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

Tracy: the folks at Tuomey have already gathered the data you had previously requested and I am scheduled to review it Monday. It may include the information you want. I will send you what they have gathered as soon as I review it and if you need anything else, just let me know.

EXHIBIT 9F

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Wednesday, October 21, 2009 3:39 PM

To: Dan Mulholland

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

Dan, for the same period of time, would you also please ask Tuomey to provide the claims data for submissions to Medicare and Medicaid by the Tuomey LLCs?

Thanks.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel: (202)307-0474 Fax: (202)305-4117

From: Dan Mulholland [mailto:DMulholland@hortyspringer.com]

Sent: Friday, October 16, 2009 7:45 AM

To: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV)

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Subject: RE: Tuomey claims data

OK.

Dan Mulholland Horty, Springer & Mattern phone: 412-687-7677

From: Hilmer, Tracy (CIV) [mailto:Tracy.Hilmer@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Thursday, October 15, 2009 5:47 PM

To: Dan Mulholland

Cc: Acker, Norman (USANCE); O'Donnell, Niall (CIV); Jonathan Harling

Subject: Tuomey claims data

Hi Dan: Now that we appear to have resolved the formatting issues with the Tuomey claims data, will you please have Tuomey provide the same type and fields of information included in the sample you gave us in July for all of the physicians with part-time contracts from January 1, 2004 to the present?

3:05-cv-02858-MBS Date Filed 01/25/10 Entry Number 413-9 Page 17 of 17

The data should include both inpatient and outpatient claims, Medicare and Medicaid. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks.

Tracy

Tracy L. Hilmer Senior Trial Counsel U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division (Frauds)

Tel: (202)307-0474 Fax: (202)305-4117